Representing National History in Three Australian Textbooks (2000-2017)

Marilyne BRUN
Université de Lorraine

https ://doi.org/10.17184/eac.8831

Abstract: This chapter proposes to study the representation of Aboriginal-settler relations in Australian history in three Australian secondary school history textbooks published in 2000, 2007 and 2017. As is the case for many settler colonies of the British Empire, the representation of national history has been a very thorny issue in Australia: from an excessive focus on European colonisers coupled with an erasure of Indigenous pasts before the 1960s, representations of Australian history have evolved since 1968 when anthropologist W.E.H. Stanner denounced the "great Australian silence", the "cult of disremembering" and "of forgetfulness practised on a national scale" that had suppressed the presence and role of Indigenous Australians (214). In the 1990s, an important series of public debates known as the History Wars questioned how Australian history should be studied, represented and taught. Contemporary textbooks published since the late 1990s are the products of these debates: their representation of national history has shifted significantly towards a fairer, and more inclusive, portrayal of Australian history. This chapter discusses each textbook's "narrative strategies or discursive fractures" (Fuchs and Henne 26) as well as the shifts that have taken place between the 2000, 2007 and 2017 editions.

Keywords: textbooks, history, Australia, Aboriginal, settler colonialism

---

The representation of national history in school textbooks is a sensitive issue for any nation. In Australia, the representation of national history has been a topic of debate for decades: in 1968, anthropologist W.E.H. Stanner denounced the "great Australian silence" – the limited representation of Indigenous Australians, and in particular of the violence of encounters with European colonisers, in Australian history writing. Stanner described the phenomenon as "a cult of forgetfulness practised on a national scale", a "cult of disremembering" (214) which had limited Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people to little more than a "melancholy footnote" in Australia's history (202). Since then, Australian historiography has experienced a

major shift from the marginal place often given to Indigenous populations before the 1960s to the central position of Indigenous-settler conflicts and frontier violence in the writing of Australian history. The late twentieth century was an important moment in this shift: the 1988 celebrations of the bicentenary of European presence in Australia led to a large number of heated discussions about what should (and shouldn't) be celebrated in its history, and the biases present in Australian history writing. They extended into by a series of debates in the 1990s known as the History Wars, which addressed how Australian history should be represented and taught[1]. Major points of debate included whether Australia's history should be taught as a story of positive success or negative impact, and how much emphasis on frontier violence, massacres and dispossession should exist in history books and textbooks.

The representation of Aboriginal populations in Australian history textbooks has been the object of much research, most of which focuses on the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and for most publications up until the 1980s, with a majority of publications studying a period before or until the 1960s[2]. Textbook research shows that until the 1960s, the history taught in Australian textbooks was predominantly – if not exclusively – from a European perspective, with an overwhelming focus on Europeans in Australia; Indigenous Australians were overall given very little place, reflecting Stanner's denunciation of the "cult of disremembering", with a combination of binary or sketchy portrayals and limited representation: the painful aspects of Australia's history, in particular the dispossession of Aboriginal Australians, were curtailed and at least partly silenced[3]. Keith Crawford's study of textbooks from the 1930s to the 1960s for example shows that Aboriginal Australians "were essentialized *via* a discourse of paternalism and cultural and biological inferiority" and "ascribed a role as marginalized spectators or as a primitive and disappearing anachronism" (90). Today, more research on textbooks published after the 1980s is needed, especially on textbooks that were published after the History Wars: this article proposes to make a contribution to the study of contemporary textbooks.

A recent shift that pertains specifically to school curricula is the passage, in 2010, to a national curriculum. Australia is a federal state; secondary education curricula were the responsibility of individual states until 2010, when a national curriculum was created from Foundation to Year 10 for English, Mathematics, Science and History. In 2012, these curricula were updated (versions 2.0 and 3.0), and further subjects were integrated into the federal curriculum to now include English, mathematics, science, humanities and social sciences, the arts, technologies, health and physical education, and languages; as I write this article, version 9.0 of the Australian curriculum has been approved and is in use. Although minor differences may still exist at state level, the shift to a national curriculum was an essential step in homogenising secondary school curricula across the nation in the subjects concerned.

[1] See Macintyre and Clark, *The History Wars* (2003).

[2] See for example Keith Crawford, "Constructing Aboriginal Australians, 1930–1960: Projecting False Memories", and the works of Anna Clark, Robyn Moore, and Heather Sharp listed in the bibliography.

[3] Many researchers speak about "selective amnesia" to refer to this phenomenon, but there is a difference between forgetting – a natural occurrence in the process of memory/remembering –, and silencing or disremembering – the erasing of some aspects of history.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

This article studies the representation of national history in Australian secondary school textbooks, more specifically the portrayal of Aboriginal populations and their relations with European colonisers in three history textbooks published in 2000, 2007 and 2017. All three textbooks were published after the History Wars and the last one reflects the shift from a state curriculum (the Victorian curriculum in the textbooks published in 2000 and 2007) to a national curriculum (the 2017 textbook). The Australian textbook market includes a handful of major publishers: Cambridge First, Jacaranda, Macmillan, Oxford Big Ideas, and Pearson. Within the scope of this article, I will focus on three textbooks published by the same publisher, Jacaranda, as comparative work is most efficient when variables remain stable, allowing for detailed analyses and analogies. Australian history features several times in primary and secondary education in history, but it is addressed in most detail and nuance in Year 9: all three history textbooks are therefore Year 9 Jacaranda history textbooks, allowing for a very clear identification of evolutions in the representation of Indigenous populations and Indigenous-settler relations.

Textbooks serve a number of different functions:

> Teaching materials should be relevant to the student or pupil's living environment, provide guidance in differentiating and developing perceptions as well as constructions and co-constructions (learning through cooperation, joint research into relevance and meaning), offer help for independent study as well as for orientation and systemisation, support the construction of basic concepts, open multiperspective approaches, offer a combination of representative forms and represent a range of interests (e.g. gender specific), and aim to encourage and develop comprehensive, problem-oriented learning processes (reflection, appraisal, evaluation) (see Aeberli 2004; Handro and Schönemann 2011). Intrinsic to the role of textbooks are therefore structure, representation, regulation, motivation, differentiation, practice, and monitoring (see Hacker 1980). (Fuchs and Henne 25-26)

Textbook research is a dynamic field of study which includes several approaches: Fuchs and Henne differentiate product-oriented textbook research (which focuses on the textbooks themselves as products) from process-oriented textbook research (which studies the life cycle of textbooks from their development to their implementation in classrooms), and impact-oriented research (that seeks to evaluate the impact of using textbooks on pupils and teachers) (29). My approach in this article is product-oriented, the covid crisis having limited opportunities to do field study in the past couple of years; the research presented here does not analyse the various ways in which these textbooks might be used by teachers and pupils, nor does it provide answers about the effect of these textbooks on their intended audience. My aim is to analyse the textual and visual contents of the textbooks to identify their "specific construction of reality as well as the[ir] considered selection and organisation of knowledge" (Fuchs and Henne 30). Textbooks are "the result of complex negotiation processes and power structures and reflec[t] differences in social class, race, gender/sex, and religious

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

affiliation between stakeholders" (Fuchs and Henne 30). Product-oriented research best allows the analysis of "the hybrid nature of the texts particularly when, and even because, they overlap and intersect different discourses" (Fuchs and Henne 29). My approach will aim to analyse each textbook's "narrative strategies or discursive fractures", that is each work's "semantic structure, function, and form in order to determine the narrative modes and latent interpretive patterns of the socio-cultural knowledge it contains" (Fuchs and Henne 26).

As part of my analysis of narrative strategies, I also locate my work in the broader frame of settler colonial theory. An existing and expanding field, settler colonial studies focuses on the specificity of settler colonial societies (societies colonised mainly for purposes of settlement, rather than colonies established primarily for trading or strategic purposes), which include Australia, Canada, New Zealand, South Africa, and the United States, to only mention major former settler colonies in the British Empire[4]. Settler colonial studies insist on the long-term impact of settlement – and therefore dispossession – in the imaginary, identity, structure and socio-political dynamics of these societies. Patrick Wolfe thus argues that "invasion is a structure not an event" in (former) settler colonies (2006, 388): invasion is not an event with a fixed beginning and end in settler colonial societies, it is a structuring principle that shapes the whole organisation of these societies. This results in a very ambiguous relation to the dispossession of Indigenous populations, which is inherently violent and negative, while at the same allowing the construction of a "new" society by Europeans, a "positive" creation made possible only through dispossession (Wolfe 2006, 388). As a result, settler colonial societies have a deeply ambiguous relation to their own history – to both its representation and its narration.

Angélique Stastny's 2018 PhD thesis provides helpful insights into the pervasive impact of settler colonial categories on Australian textbooks. Her thesis comparatively studies textbooks from Australia (between 1877 and 2012) and Kanaky/New Caledonia (between 1990 and 2015; the territory only started publishing its own history textbooks in the 1990s), with a focus on the representation of Indigenous-settler relations. Stastny concludes that the teaching of Indigenous-settler relationships in Australia and Kanaky-New Caledonia is best described as participating in "settler regimes of ignorance" (18), which refer to "settlers dominating the political, epistemic and emotional spheres of […] settler colonial societies" (19). Textbooks and teaching practices in Australia are characterised by "settler colonial epistemological logics" (151); Stastny identifies a number devices in these regimes of ignorance, three of which are most relevant for my analysis of the three textbooks. Stastny analyses a first device she calls "self-distantiation", that is the ways in which "colonial violence is distanced both temporally and morally" in the textbooks (165); violence is both externalised – performed by those outside of or deviant from the system (Europeans of

[4]Major works in settler colonial studies include the works of Patrick Wolfe (some of which are listed in the bibliography below), and important edited volumes such as Evans, Grimshaw *et al.*, *Equal Subjects, Unequal Rights: Indigenous Peoples in British Settler Colonies, 1830-1910* (2003); Elkins and Pedersen, *Settler Colonialism in the Twentieth Century: Projects, Practices, Legacies* (2005); Coombes, *Rethinking Settler Colonialism: History and Memory in Australia, Canada, Aotearoa New Zealand and South Africa* (2006); Banivanua Mar and Edmond, *Making Settler Colonial Space: Perspectives on Race, Place and Identity* (2010); and Cavanagh and Veracini's *Routledge Handbook of the History of Settler Colonialism* (2017). Lorenzo Veracini has published numerous works on settler colonialism in Australia and beyond.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

lower ranks or lower morals) – and distanced through its depiction as peripheral events occurring beyond government control (165). The second device has to do with fixed categorisation: Australian textbooks rely on the opposition between two fixed, non-porous political categories, Indigenous vs. settler (169), thus "immobilis[ing] people" (Veracini quoted in Stastny 184). Finally, textbooks mobilise numerous epistemological strategies to sustain settler legitimacy: Aboriginal populations are "intrinsically represented as reactive (reacting to unjust policies) and shaped by others (i.e. by the settler colonial polity which deprives them of their rights and justice)"; "colonialism remains the only defining element for Indigenous people, who are exclusively framed in terms of resistance to, and consequences of, settler power" (177), whereas "[s]ettlers are largely represented with self-constituted characteristics as independent historical and political actors" (180). The same goes for other non-European settlers, who, like Indigenous Australians, are represented "only in relation to the settler colonial polity, as they come into contact with it" (101), thus placing "settlers as the nexus of all social-political relationships" (171).

Having detailed my theoretical approach, I now wish to turn to the three Year 9 Jacaranda history textbooks respectively published in 2000, 2007 and 2017. The 2000 and 2007 editions are based on the same canvas: their tables of contents are rather similar (even though clear changes were made between the 2000 and the 2007 editions), and they both followed the history curriculum of the state of Victoria[5]. The 2017 edition, having operated the shift to the national curriculum, is significantly different, in terms of curriculum and organisation of knowledge[6].

A comparison of the 2000 and 2007 editions, which were both based on the Victorian curriculum, shows a similar overall structure, but significant differences in the representation of Australian history. Aboriginal populations are addressed in the opening and closing chapters of the 2000 edition, with a first chapter entitled "Settlement and Conflict" and a last chapter on "Justice for Indigenous Communities", which symbolically position Indigenous populations at the beginning and end of the narration of the nation, raising the question of whether this positioning acts as an acknowledgement of their importance or as a marginalisation of their place in the nation's history. Outside of these two chapters, there is very little to no mention of Aboriginal populations in other chapters, as the table of contents clearly demonstrates: a section here and there deals with their history ("7.15 The Referendum and Beyond"), but the proposed narration on national construction is a traditional one, with an emphasis on settler history (the gold rush, bushrangers, the road to Federation, contributions to World War I and World War II, the great depression and the Cold War).

The 2007 edition has the same overall structure, but several titles were renamed; the two chapters that echo the first and last chapters of the 2000 edition were respectively renamed "1788: Contact, Colonisation and Conflict" and "Changing Rights and Freedoms", which includes progress in Aboriginal rights, but also in (European) women's rights. Two additional chapters were added at the end of the textbook, one on "Changing Culture and Technology", the other on "Australia as a Global Citi-

[5]The 2000 edition was authored by Robert Engwerda, Richard Cotter and Maureen Anderson; the 2007 edition by Maureen Anderson and Anne Low.

[6]The 2017 edition was authored by Robert Darlington, Graeme Smithies and Ashley Wood.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

zen". The table of contents is in colour, with the addition of drawings and images illustrating pre-contact Aboriginal life in south-western Australia, gold searching techniques, "marvellous" Melbourne, Australian soldiers in Egypt in 1915, a popular 1920s women's jazz band, the war in Vietnam, and a boy and a UN peacekeeper representing the role of the United Nations in East Timor's independence. The 2007 edition shows an effort to include more sections on Aboriginal populations, like "5.8 Indigenous voices in the 1930s" whose significance is somewhat belittled by the fact that the next section is fully dedicated to racing horse Phar Lap…

A closer look at the first chapter of the two editions reveals marked changes between 2000 and 2007. The titles of the chapters, respectively "Settlement and Conflict" in 2000 and "1788: Contact, Colonisation and Conflict" in 2007, demonstrate a clear acknowledgement of the impact of colonisation: describing the colonisation of Australia with the neutral term "settlement" implies a smooth, peaceful, innocuous process, thus erasing the violence behind the dispossession of Aboriginal lands; the reformulation in 2007 into "contact, colonisation and conflict" better acknowledges the presence of Aboriginal populations ("contact") as well as the gradual and destructive dimensions of European presence ("colonisation and conflict"). The detail of the sections of each chapter shows this move towards more representation of Indigenous Australians rather than Eurocentric history. In the first chapter of the 2000 edition, only 4 sections out of 12 deal with Aboriginal peoples – the 4 final, constituting the final third of the chapter; the first 8 deal with European actions in Australia in a very traditionally Eurocentric narrative[7]. One cannot but be surprised at the markedly conservative representation of national history proposed here. The 2007 edition reduces this Eurocentric bias: the first section of the chapter starts with an overview of pre-contact lives and beliefs, as its title indicates ("1.1 Land, law and the Dreaming"). The second section, "1.2 *Terra Nullius* and the arrival of the British", presents British colonisation, but acknowledges right from the start its impact on Aboriginal populations. Four other sections address Aboriginal Australians[8], which brings the total number of sections on Aboriginal Australians to 6 out of 10, that is from 33% of sections on Aboriginal populations in the 2000 edition to 60% in 2007. A clear effort is made in the 2007 edition to recognise Aboriginal dispossession even in sections on European actions: "1.7 The making of Melbourne" starts with a first paragraph that acknowledges it was Kulin land, before moving on to discuss Batman's "treaty" and John Pascoe Fawkner (18-19). The first chapters thus demonstrate a significant shift towards voicing the Aboriginal point of view, stating the primacy of Aboriginal presence and representing frontier violence.

The last chapter of the 2000 edition, "Justice for Indigenous Communities", symbolically closes with Aboriginal peoples, thus giving them an important weight in the textbook; yet any teacher knows that the final chapters are those that are not taught

[7]The first 8 sections are entitled: "1.1 Why choose Australia?", "1.2 Arthur Phillip – the first governor", "1.3 Early problems with settlement", "1.4 Convict women", "1.5 Convict men", "1.6 Crime and punishment", "1.7 Macquarie the builder", and "1.8 Notable European women of New South Wales". The 4 final sections finally address Aboriginal presence: "1.9 Aboriginal attitudes towards the Europeans", which considers Aboriginal populations *only* in relation to Europeans, "1.10 European attitudes towards the Aborigines", "1.11 Frontier violence and Aboriginal resistance", and "1.12 Massacre and disease".

[8]They are entitled "1.6 Resistance", "1.8 'Protected' lives", "1.9 Managing the missions", and "1.10 Living together".

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

if time runs out at the end of the year… An impact-oriented approach would best identify whether this final position gives greater weight to the topic or more likelihood to be dropped out of the curriculum. In the 2007 edition, Aboriginal rights, which had a dedicated chapter in 2000, are gathered with women's rights in a general chapter on "Changing rights and freedoms". The chapter encourages pupils to connect claims from different groups, but drowns the specificity of Aboriginal claims in a general chapter on oppressed populations, in which many other oppressed groups could have hoped to be mentioned. But gathering Aboriginal rights (in the first 6 sections) and (white) women's rights (in the 4 final sections) in one chapter symbolically conflates them, neither taking into account the particular discriminations faced by Indigenous populations, nor acknowledging the possibility of intersectionality: Aboriginal women face discrimination both as Indigenous and gendered members of society.

Despite the fact that the textbooks were produced only seven years apart, a very clear difference in approach can be identified in each chapter's textual and visual contents. The 2000 textbook provides very limited representation or acknowledgement of Aboriginal points of view, with hardly any quotes from Aboriginal individuals, Indigenous oral testimonies, or Aboriginal productions. The first words of section "1.9 Aboriginal attitudes towards the Europeans" state that

> The Aborigines were astonished when first contacts were made with Europeans. White people were not part of the Dreaming creation stories and had never been seen before. The Aborigines reasoned therefore that the Europeans could not exist and that perhaps they were ghosts of dead relatives – their pale skins supported that idea. If they were ghosts, however, the Aborigines thought they were stupid ghosts because they could not speak Aboriginal languages. (20)

The variety of Aboriginal reactions to invaders are summarised into the simplistic narrative of Aborigines believing Europeans to be ghosts. The section contains two illustrations: one of Aborigines attacking a settler's hut, the other of Aborigines stealing sheep from a European farmer or pastoralist (20-21). The point of view is again Eurocentric: Aborigines are not described as defending their territory, physical integrity or making up for the loss of game due to European presence, they are negatively and Eurocentrically described as "attacking" or "stealing". Although the text of the chapter introduces more nuance than the two illustrations, one cannot but be dismayed at the negative portrayal of Aboriginal populations conveyed by the paintings: pupils do not always read the text of sections, but iconographic documents are almost always perused and their visual impact is often lasting.

The 2000 edition further tends to narrate Australian history in a way that excuses or eludes white violence. Section "1.10 European attitudes towards the Aborigines", opens with the idealisation of "native" people as "noble savages" to only later admit that the majority of colonisers had a negative image of Aborigines:

> At the time Australia was invaded by the English, *some people* in Europe believed in the idea of the "noble savage". This was an idealised view of

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

> "native" people in their natural surroundings, unaffected and uncorrupted by civilisation. *People* admired the "noble savage". However, *most* white settlers who came to Australia thought that black people were inferior. (22, my emphases)

Why open with a view that only concerned a minority of *people* (*not* settlers)? The "noble savage" view is then described with generalisations ("People admired…"), to finally present the majority point of view, thus partly eluding the issue of white prejudice and violence. On the next page, pupils are asked to classify the five sources of the section "into those which are sympathetic and those which are not sympathetic towards the Aborigines" (23): settlers do not discriminate, mistreat or perform violence, they only lack "sympathy"… Despite its title, section "1.11 Frontier Violence and Aboriginal Resistance" takes care to emphasise benevolent European attitudes towards Indigenous populations:

> It is important to note that violence was not inevitable as the two cultures met. Some European settlers, including the Curr family in central Victoria, understood that they were "using" Aboriginal land. The family "paid" for the use of land by regularly giving the Aborigines animals which they could kill for food. (24)

This quote is the only concrete example in the section, which gives undue emphasis to benevolent attitudes over more negative (and more prevalent) positions. The next section similarly eludes white violence: entitled "1.12 Massacre and disease", it does not mention reserves, missions, or punitive expeditions; its emphasis is surprisingly on the Native Police. The responsibility for violence is firmly located on Native Police forces, composed of "Aboriginal troopers and European officers" (27); the text fails to provide a percentage to get an idea of their respective weight. The questions at the end of the section ask: "The Native Police were later described as 'mobile assassination squads'. How do you think they earnt this reputation?"; and "What chance do you think Kurnai warriors, like the one shown in source 1.12.1, had against Native Police like those shown in source 1.12.5?" (27). The elusion – erasure – of settler responsibility could not be clearer, with a deliberate emphasis set on the Native Police as a violent entity.

The 2007 edition has a much more nuanced representation of these historical events. For one, Aboriginal voices are represented; the texts do not speak generally about Aboriginal people but make the effort to identify the nation concerned: section "1.2 *Terra Nullius* and the arrival of the British" explains that the First Fleet arrived on Gadigal lands, and mentions the name Gadigal people gave to the area, Warrane (8). The addition of section "1.1 Land, law and the Dreaming" symbolically presents Aboriginal populations and their cultures before British colonisation is evoked; the 2000 edition started solely with the European point of view ("1.1 Why choose Australia?"). Section "1.6 Resistance", includes numerous Aboriginal perspectives (16-17), and pupils are asked to "outlin[e] the nineteenth-century contribution of Aboriginal people to Australian development" (25). Recognition of white respon-

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

sibility is also much clearer. Section "1.8 'Protected' lives" explains the ambiguous role that reserves and missions played in Australian history with nuance:

> By the late 1820s, the British were discussing the need to "protect" Aboriginal people by removing them from their land and confining them to a controlled reserve. An evangelical movement that put pressure on the government to take a stronger stand in the protection of "native peoples" was gaining support in Britain. The self-interest of the settlers was in sharp contrast to the humanitarian ideals of such British reformers. (20)

The 2007 textbooks includes some elusion of white violence, although this takes a more subtle form than in the 2000 edition. The ideology of the noble savage is also evoked, but white responsibility is shunned in a different way:

> Some educated Europeans regarded these people as "noble savages" – primitive people who lived a contended life in the natural world without the pressures of civilisation. Most of the new European arrivals, however, were neither educated nor sensitive. The majority were convicts, many of whom had been brutalised. (8-9)

Here, the question of white violence is directly connected to education: the formulation implies that whites who were educated were sensitive to the condition of Aboriginal peoples and did not use violence, and therefore that violence came from those that were "neither educated nor sensitive". Education – or its lack thereof – is presented as the determining factor in triggering violence. No historical or psychological study has ever proven any form of connection between being educated and being empathetic, even less between being educated and being less violent towards Indigenous populations… Convicts, finally, are excused for their violence: they are not inherently brutal individuals, they were brutalised (by others, by the system) and are therefore divested of any responsibility in the violence perpetrated; their *personal* history justifies and forces their inclination towards violence. As Stastny argues, the savagery of settlers is often represented as *circumstantial* – the result of their isolation, fear or vulnerability (162); this is very much the case here, as violence is presented as determined by one's education and personal experience, not as the result of actual individual choices or of systemic/structural discrimination towards Indigenous populations. The concluding section, "1.10 Living together", mentions some issues, like the lack of recognition of the Aboriginal cricket team after their 1868 tour of England (25), but is a feel-good chapter about friendships and cooperation between Aborigines and settlers that concludes on an excessively positive note.

A major shift can therefore clearly be identified between the 2000 and 2007 editions, from a traditional Eurocentric narrative of Australian history to a much more nuanced account that includes Aboriginal perspectives. The shift seems rather late knowing that the History Wars took place throughout the 1990s, but might be explained by the conservative atmosphere of the late 1990s in Australia, and the time it takes for social changes to affect textbooks. The description of the introduction of smallpox

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

best illustrates the different approaches of the two textbooks: the 2000 edition states in passing that the disease was "introduced into Australia by Macassan sailors" (27), while the 2007 edition explains that "The Dharug were also hit hard by fatal diseases, such as smallpox, that had been introduced into their community through contact with Europeans" (10). The elusion of white responsibility is striking in the 2000 edition, where smallpox is not even associated with European colonisers and the responsibility for its introduction fully attributed to non-European foreigners.

Let us now turn to the third Jacaranda textbook from 2017[9]. Here, the comparison cannot be as direct because of the shift in curriculum: the 2000 and 2007 editions followed the Victorian curriculum on Australia as a nation; the 2017 edition complies with the national curriculum, whose Year 9 theme is "The Making of the Modern World (1750-1918)". It includes the following topics (the first three of which are not all studied): "The Industrial Revolution (1750-1914)", "Progressive ideas and movements (1750-1918)", "Movement of peoples (1750-1901)", "Australia and Asia", "Asia and the world", "Making a nation", and "World War I (1914-1918)"[10]. The emphasis on transnational dynamics and on framing Australian history within wider historical movements and trends is clear. In Year 10, pupils move on to study "The Modern World and Australia (1918-present)"[11]. Because of the chronological division between Years 9 and 10 in the national curriculum, colonisation and conflict are studied in Year 9, but twentieth-century changes in Aboriginal people's rights and freedoms are now addressed in Year 10 and do not feature in the 2017 Year 9 textbook; for this reason, I did not discuss the depiction of this theme in the 2000 and 2007 editions and will only focus on the representation of colonisation and conflict in the 2017 textbook. The national curriculum themes for Years 9 and 10 show a distinct change in emphasis from national to transnational dynamics, with gives a marked priority to global movements and Australia's position within these dynamics.

The topic "Making a nation" – the only one which is not primarily transnational – is divided in two chapters in the textbook: a first chapter addresses "Colonisation and conflict", while a second one is entitled "From colonies to nationhood" and focuses more traditionally on European actions and achievements in Australia. The first chapter, which we will focus on, includes 2 introductory sections ("5.1 Overview" and one on source selection), 9 sections on Indigenous-settler relations and 2 sections on restrictions to immigration ("5.11 Attitudes to Asians: Chinese diggers" and "5.12 'White Australia' and the outside world")[12]. The 9 central sections on Indigenous-settler relations are in keeping with the changes observed between the 2000 and 2007 editions, and further extend them: they propose a nuanced and rather comprehensive discussion of Aboriginal-coloniser conflicts. The departure from conservative Eurocentric

[9] A first edition of the Jacaranda *History Alive 9* textbook was published in 2012, just two years after the publication of the national curriculum; it is not included in this study because of space constraints.

[10] The 2017 Jacaranda textbook follows the national curriculum. In 2019, Jacaranda published a *History Alive 9* textbook specifically on the Victorian curriculum, the only state-specific textbook they have published since the creation of the national curriculum. According to the Website of the Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority, the Victorian curriculum "incorporates the Australian Curriculum and reflects Victorian priorities and standards"; version 2.0 of the Victorian curriculum is currently being developed.

[11] The theme includes the following topics: "World War II (1939-45)", "Rights and freedoms (1945-the present)", "The globalising world", "Popular culture (1945-present)", "Migration experiences (1945-present)", and "The environment movement (1960s-present)".

[12] See below for a discussion of these two "stranded" sections on non-white immigration to Australia.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

narratives of Australian history is notable, with careful attention given to providing a variety of points of view and equitable representation: there is a balance between Indigenous and settler voices, with primacy often given to Aboriginal voices. Two massacres of Aboriginal populations are given a visual depiction through a drawing that indicates the different sites of the massacre, the movement of colonisers and the attacked Indigenous populations, bringing a very real dimension to the textual summary of the massacres (172 and 173), ensuring weight and impact on pupils through its visual representation of the circumstances of such violence[13]. Some "settler colonial epistemological logics" (Stastny 151) can still be identified in isolated occurrences. Although its visual depiction on page 172 is poignant, the 1834 Pinjarra massacre is only referred to as the Pinjarra "incident", a "*clash* that lasted over an hour" (171-172, my emphasis); although the word "massacre" is used for other dramatic events in the textbook, recurringly calling the massacre an "incident" is surprising considering the tone of the textbook. On page 175, pupils are asked to "Examine SOURCE 1 [the visual representation of the Pinjarra massacre]. As a class, discuss whether you think the Pinjarra incident should be called a battle or a massacre"; the question forgets to ask whether the Pinjarra "incident" should still be called an "incident", reiterating a problematic euphemism. Here and there, the textbook includes a tendency to use rather positive quotations from colonisers in the primary documents quoted: on pages 146-147, three out of four sources from settlers and British administrators are positive towards the local populations, a rate that does not reflect the ratio of positive attitudes in historical documents. The desire to provide a variety of views goes all the way to quoting Keith Windshuttle's *The Fabrication of Aboriginal History Volume One* (156), a controversial work which is not recognised as reliable history by many historians today… The guiding idea was probably to give a voice to all sides of the debate, but pupils may not have the critical distance to understand the controversial dimension of Windshuttle's position and works.

Two new features not present in the 2000 and 2007 editions are worth underlining in the 2017 textbook: at the beginning of each chapter, a subsection entitled "Links with our times" (144-145 in chapter 5) reveals a concern to make history relevant for pupils and to encourage them to create connections between historical events or dynamics and how these may parallel present situations or have echoes in their lives. Another new emphasis is a reflection on history as a discipline: pupils are incited to consider how history uses sources and works around gaps in evidence. The second section of the chapter is entitled "5.2 How do we know about race relations in colonial Australia?" and explains the types of sources used to study the historical period. In Chapter 6 ("From colonies to nationhood"), section "6.2 How do we know about late colonial and early twentieth-century Australia" lists the types of evidence used by historians to study the topic, including official sources, mass media and personal records, and visual sources (189). In Chapter 5, a whole section is dedicated to source analysis and historical methodology: "5.7 SkillBuilder: Identifying gaps in evidence" (163-165). Located right after section "5.6 Blood on the frontier", which studies Aboriginal resistance to white invasion and some massacres (Myall Creek, Warrigal

[13]The two massacres represented are the 1834 Pinjarra "incident" in Western Australia (172) and the 1884 defeat of the Kalkadoons at Battle Mountain in Queensland (173). See below for a discussion of the use of the word "incident".

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

Creek), the section on source analysis invites pupils to reflect on historians' need to use critical distance, nuance and precision in their work. Historical method is a central concern throughout the textbook, with explanations of the evidence used to establish what is presented throughout the textbook, a concern that was not present in the 2000 and 2007 editions.

The national curriculum includes a marked emphasis on Australia's insertion into transnational dynamics; within this context, one may be surprised to see very little transnational contents – such as a crosscultural comparisons with Indigenous populations in Canada or the United States – in the chapter on colonisation and conflict. The focus is strictly on Australia as a nation, without considering similar and/or related dynamics in the rest of the world. A similar point may be made for the chapter's two "stranded" sections on non-white immigration to Australia: the chapter entitled "Colonisation and conflict", includes two sections that thematically stand out, one on the exclusion of Chinese diggers (177-179), the other on the white Australia policy (180-182). The logic of inserting 6 pages on the rejection of non-white immigration in a chapter that includes over 30 pages on Indigenous-settler relations is difficult to understand; why not insert these sections in the chapter "From colonies to nationhood"? Why not include transnational connections with other laws passed to exclude Chinese immigration, in the United States for example? The treatment of Chinese exclusion from immigration to Australia is very short, and no connection is drawn between the similar logics behind the denial of citizenship to Aborigines and the rejection of the Chinese and Pacific island labourers ("Kanakas"); an analogous logic of controlling land and national territory through exclusion was at work, but these connections are not established or hinted at.

Another division of contents is between the first chapter on "Colonisation and conflict" and the second chapter "From colonies to nationhood", creating a neat separation between the history of Aboriginal-settler relations and the creation of the nation through settler actions. This separation generates the space to present the history of Indigenous Australians and Aboriginal-settler relations in nuance and detail in the first chapter, but fails to give an insight into the connections between the denial of citizenship to Aboriginal Australians and the building of the nation, and of the contributions of Indigenous people to the creation of the nation. How can we explain the separation between these two interconnected aspects of Australian history? The disconnection between Aboriginal and settler history might come from the desire to dedicate a full chapter (except for the two sections on non-white immigration to Australia) to Indigenous-settler relations, but the inability to think about "Colonisation and conflict" and "From colonies to nationhood" in connection, the lack of integration of Indigenous Australians with the rest of Australian and international history is surprising in a fundamentally transnational curriculum. The separation reinforces Stastny's contention that settlers keep being positioned "as the nexus of all social-political relationships" (171) in Australian textbooks; Aborigines are marginalised in the chapter on the creation of the nation, a trope that is common to settler colonies and that needs to be challenged and confronted in history textbooks.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

To conclude, the three textbooks show a clear shift in discourses and representations of colonisation, with the 2000 textbook being surprisingly late in integrating more balanced views of contact and conflict, and greater detail and nuance about Indigenous-settler relations in the 2007 edition and again in 2017: we can see a significant move towards a more accurate, fair and balanced representation of colonial conflict. Although fixed categorisation is a reality in all three textbooks, with most narratives framed on an Aboriginal-coloniser binary, we can note an increase in nuance within this binary, with a growing emphasis on the variety of identities, attitudes and approaches that may have existed in the two groups. Generally speaking, textbooks are "media in which *conflicting* discourses co-exist" (Macgilchrist 174; emphasis in the text) and which "reveal incoherencies and friction between different discourse threads." (Fuchs and Henne 29). These three textbooks are no exception, with the presence of tropes sustaining settler colonialism: colonisers are still positioned as the centre of socio-political relationships in Australia, in particular in relation to other discriminated groups such as Kanakas or the Chinese. Aboriginal Australians are more visible and more active agents in the two more recent textbooks; yet what still lacks visibility is their interactions with groups other than white colonisers. Such interactions with Chinese migrants, Japanese pearlers, Kanakas, … are well known in academic research, but are not yet present in textbooks[14]. With the shift towards understanding Australia's place within the wider world and its connections to transnational dynamics, the representation of these themes will hopefully evolve towards even more nuance.

Bibliography

Anderson, Maureen ; Low, Anne, *Jacaranda Essentials: History 2*, Milton, Queensland, John Wiley & Sons Australia, 2007.

Australian Curriculum (2023) : https://www.australiancurriculum.edu.au/

Cavanagh, Edward ; Veracini, Lorenzo (eds), *The Routledge Handbook of the History of Settler Colonialism*, Routledge, London, 2017.

Clark, Anna (2004), "Whose History? Teaching Australia's Contested Past", *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 36, p. 533-541.

Clark, Anna, *Teaching the Nation: Politics and Pedagogy in Australian History*, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, 2006.

Clark, Anna, *History's Children: History Wars in the Classroom*, UNSW Press, Sydney, 2008.

Clark, Anna (2009), "Teaching the Nation's Story: Comparing Public Debates and Classroom Perspectives on History Education in Australia and Canada", *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 41.6, p. 745-762.

Clark, Anna (2010), "Politicians Using History", *Australian Journal of Politics and History* 56.1, p. 119-130.

Coombes, Annie (éd.) (2006), *Rethinking Settler Colonialism: History and Memory in Australia, Canada, Aotearoa New Zealand and South Africa*, Manchester University Press, Manchester.

Crawford, Keith (2013), "Constructing Aboriginal Australians, 1930-1960: Projecting False Memories", *Journal of Educational Media, Memory and Society* 5.1, p. 90-107.

[14]See Edwards and Shen, eds, *Lost in the Whitewash: Aboriginal-Asian Encounters in Australia, 1901-2001* (2003), Peta Stephenson, *The Outsiders Within: Telling Australia's Indigenous-Asian Story* (2007) and the special section on Indigenous Australian and Asian histories of *Aboriginal History* edited by Peta Stephenson and Christine Choo (2011).

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

Darlington, Robert; Smithies, Graeme; Wood, Ashley, *Jacaranda History Alive 9*, John Wiley & Sons Australia, Milton, Queensland, 2017.

Edwards, Penny; Shen Yuanfang (eds) (2003), *Lost in the Whitewash: Aboriginal-Asian Encounters in Australia, 1901-2001*, ANU Press, Canberra.

Elkins, Caroline; Pedersen, Susan (eds) (2005), *Settler Colonialism in the Twentieth Century: Projects, Practices, Legacies*, Routledge, New York.

Engwerda, Robert; Cotter, Richard; Anderson, Maureen, *Jacaranda Studies of Society & Environment: Australian History*, John Wiley & Sons Australia, Milton, Queensland, 2000.

Evans, Julie; Grimshaw, Patricia; Philips, David; Swain, Shurlee (eds) (2003), *Equal Subjects, Unequal Rights: Indigenous Peoples in British Settler Colonies, 1830-1910*, Manchester University Press, Manchester.

Fuchs, Eckhardt; Henne, Kathrin (2018), "History of Textbook Research", in Fuchs, Eckhardt; Bock, Annekatrin (eds), *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*, Palgrave Macmillan, New York, p. 25-56.

History in the F-10 Australian Curriculum (2023), https://www.australiancurriculum.edu.au/f-10-curriculum/humanities-and-social-sciences/history/

Macgilchrist, Felicitas (2018), "Materiality and Mediality of Textbooks", in Fuchs, Eckhardt; Bock, Annekatrin (eds), *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*, Palgrave Macmillan, New York, p. 169-177.

Macintyre, Stuart ; Clark, Anna, *The History Wars*, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, 2003.

More, Robyn (2017), "History Textbooks Still Imply that Australians are White", *The Conversation*, https://theconversation.com/history-textbooks-still-imply-that-australians-are-white-72796

More, Robyn (2020), "Secondary School Textbooks Teach our Kids the Myth that Aboriginal Australians were Nomadic Hunter-Gatherers", *The Conversation*, https://theconversation.com/secondary-school-textbooks-teach-our-kids-the-myth-that-aboriginal-australians-were-nomadic-hunter-gatherers-133066

More, Robyn (2020), "Whiteness = Politeness: Interest-Convergence in Australian History Textbooks, 1950-2010", *Critical Discourse Studies* 17.1, p. 111-129.

More, Robyn (2020), "Who is Australian? National Belonging and Exclusion in Australian History Textbooks", *Review of Education* 9.2, p. 55-77.

Sharp, Heather (2010), "Constructing History: Selective Representations of Indigenous Australians and British Heritages in Queensland History Curriculum", Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Southern Queensland.

Sharp, Heather (2013), "What We Teach Our Children: A Comparative Analysis of Indigenous Australians in Social Studies Curriculum, from the 1960s to the 1980s", *Social and Education History* 2.2, p. 176-204.

Stanner, W.E.H. (1979), "After the Dreaming (1968)", in *White Man Got No Dreaming: Essays 1938-1973*, Canberra, ANU Press.

Stastny, Angélique (2018), "Settler Regimes of Ignorance: Teaching Indigenous-Settler Relationships in Schools in Australia and Kanaky/New Caledonia", Unpublished PhD Thesis, The University of Melbourne.

Stephenson, Peta (2007), *The Outsiders Within: Telling Australia's Indigenous-Asian Story*, Sydney, UNSW Press.

Stephenson, Peta ; Choo, Christine (eds) (2011), Special Section: Indigenous Australian and Asian histories (including an introduction and four articles), *Aboriginal History* 35, p. 113-197.

"The Victorian Curriculum F-10" (2023), Website of the Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority, https://victoriancurriculum.vcaa.vic.edu.au/

Veracini, Lorenzo (2007), "Historylessness: Australia as a Settler Colonial Collective", *Postcolonial Studies* 10.3, p. 271-285.

Veracini, Lorenzo (2013), "'Settler Colonialism': Career of a Concept", *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 41.2, p. 313-333.

Veracini, Lorenzo (2014), "Defending Settler Colonial Studies", *Australian Historical Studies* 45.3, p. 311-316.

Veracini, Lorenzo (2014), "Understanding Colonialism and Settler Colonialism as Distinct Formations", *Interventions: International Journal of Postcolonial Studies* 16.5, p. 615-633.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN: 9782813005236, doi: 10.17184/eac.9782813005236

Wolfe, Patrick, *Settler Colonialism and the Transformation of Anthropology: The Politics and Poetics of an Ethnographic Event*, Cassell, London, 1999.

Wolfe, Patrick (2006), "Settler Colonialism and the Elimination of the Native", *Journal of Genocide Research* 8.4, p. 387-409.

Wolfe, Patrick, *Traces of History: Elementary Structures of Race*, Verso, London, 2016.

Published in : JABER, Fadi (dir.), *Transmission de modèles et d'idéaux à travers le manuel scolaire*, Editions des archives contemporaines, ISBN : 9782813005236, doi : 10.17184/eac.9782813005236