Fieldwork turning blind eyes

Emilie Da Lage
Université de Lille, GERIICO.

Résumé : Music is one ways – there are others – through which exiles deploy subjectivation forms that allow the building of more or less cosmopolitan collectives. It is one way of creating a range of space and time in which it is possible to commit in various ways. Music has also a "potential" of creating collective commitment. The present chapter also question the conditions of ethnography in field work organized by a strong grid of multiple surveillances and advocate to move from an observation of what people do in precarious situation, toward a listening position in order to imagine ways of acting together.

Mots-clés : Migration, Music, Camps, Ethnography, Media

"Jungles" "camps" and "centers" where migrants in transit are put aside are our contemporary globalization real chronotopes and contradictory narratives objects. They are also the places of production of a culture of life in transition. In these places people settle a little, precariously. In these places of transition, exiles as well as volunteers and employees are engaged in the organization of very specific hospitality forms that combine extremely strong and intense commitments to precarious presences.

Lots of work has been done these past few years on migration camps or detention centers. They are often described as "sensible fieldwork". In 2017, a special issue of *Migration et Société*, explores some of the difficulties to conduct fieldwork in these contexts. Alice Corbet and Benedict Michalon [1] expose the multiple collaborations effects between researchers and aid agencies on building and mobilizing knowledge about migrant camps. This field of expertise is characterized by *"the very strong interconnection between public spaces for scientific debate and militant spaces for discussion"*[2] as other closed or semi closed fieldwork.

1. Corbet, Alice, et Bénédicte Michalon. « Collaborer avec des organismes non gouvernementaux pour enquêter sur les camps de migrants et de déplacés. Le savoir comme enjeu professionnel », *Migrations Société*, vol. 167, no. 1, 2017, p. 53-62.

2. Boe, Carolina ; Fisher, Nicolas, "L'ethnographe en milieu fermé. Deux enquêtes sur les étrangers en prison et en rétention administrative face à l'expertise associative et aux enjeux de la publication", in : Laurens, Sylvain ; Neyrat, Frédéric (sous la direction de), *Enquêter : de quel droit ? Menaces sur l'enquête en sciences sociales*, Bellecombe-en-Bauges : Éditions du Croquant, 2010, 320 p. , p. 117-138 (voir p. 120)

Their experiences confirm that the modalities of cooperation between researchers and humanitarian organizations are very variable and that the position of the researcher must be constantly negotiated. In these works, knowledge is a decisive issue. By bringing the scientific and the militant field together around a project, it has complex effects on the relationships maintained by the professionals of the field in the heart of the collaboration.

Besides, the current politicization of migration, in particular the phenomenon of the relegation of foreigners and informal camps, transform the access to information and it's dissemination in a political issue that has repercussions on all professional actors. Displaced camps and places of confinement turn out to be an arena that puts professional positions in tension, and raises questions of the legitimacy to talk about migrants.

Between Decembre 2015 to April 2017, I led a fieldwork in the camps of Grande-Synthe in the North of France. I started the investigation in the slum of the Basroch and did mainly of the work on the more official La Linière camp. These questions haunted my research. Even though I did not question frontally border crossing and migration policies political issues. The research action I conducted, was about the musical practices in these specific settings of "forced migration" and migration camps.

My interest in music relie on my previous researches on World Music and on the observation that music was an important part of the camp landscapes. It is also linked to an opportunity to respond to a demand of a worker of the ONG "Médecins sans Frontières" MSF, who had previously worked in a musical venue in the nearby town of Lille, to organize some cultural activities on the camp.

It appears that music is one of the ways – there are others – through which exiles deploy forms of subjectivation that allow the building of more or less cosmopolitan collectives. It is one of the ways of creating a range of space and time in which it is possible to commit in various ways. Music has also a "potential" of creating collective commitment. Exploring the conditions of realization of this potential is also a way of exploring some political dimensions of migrant camps. Considering musical practices with the Information and Communication Sciences forces to pay attention to several essential characteristics of musical practices : they intitiate communication practices and are constituted by and in practices and devices of communication. In this study, "playing music or singing" and listening to recorded music are considered as musical practices. We consider listening as a musical activity and don't make a hierarchy between these forms of musical practices, even though they imply different activities.

1 Grande Synthe : Considering Migration of Transit as an art of dwelling temporary

Grande Synthe is a city on Dunkirk outskirts, one of the biggest French harbor. It is an industrialised city, affected by the crisis, and it is, since the closure of Sangatte humanitarian reception center, a stage for the exiles, mainly Kurds, who seek to join England. The history of the Linière camp in Grande-Synthe is linked to the commitment of the mayor of the town in the search for dignified solutions for exiles

passing through his city, and the implication of the ONG "MSF. In the summer of 2015, the number of exiles literally exploded, overwhelming the local historical associations that provided humanitarian aid. The living conditions became extremely hard in the main camp of the city. In association with M.S.F. and various associations, particularly English such as Aid Box Community or The Refugee Community Kitchen, and against the will of the French government, the municipal team decided to build an atypical camp. It was made of wooden huts and then during the first months of installation, various buildings, also in wood, housing a recreation center, various collective kitchens, around a rehabilitated farmhouse. The camp was more than 95% Iraqi Kurdish en route to England and taking advantage of the nearby highway area.

The camp's management was entrusted to a young humanitarian association, Utopia 56, engaged in Calais and Basroch on the waste management and sharing with the municipal team the will to make the Linière camp a place open to associative and citizen initiatives.

Utopia 56 managed the first months of the camp installation, mobilizing a large number of volunteers, organizing logistics and trying to coordinate the initiatives of associations that came from all over Europe and did not necessarily share the same way of doing things, nor the same ethical objectives. Financially choked, the Grande-Synthe municipality finally obtained the French government financial support. Utopia 56 has given way to another managing association, the AFEJI.

Tensions in the camp increased over the months, linked to the gradual camp's degradation – humidity shelters, large puddles in the camp – the withdrawing of historical associations such as MSF, the reinforcement of control, the helplessness in the face of the violence suffered by the exiles from the different groups of smugglers, then, after the complete Calais camp destruction, the overpopulation and the difficult cohabitation between exiles. A fire destroyed the camp completely on April 11, 2017.

Despite efforts to humanize the living conditions on the *La Linière* camp, violence, precariousness and uncertainty constituted the exiles "daily life". La Linière story is completely linked to the problematic of transit migration in Europe and of the grey area the European migration policies created. People who are in Grande-Synthe are not supposed to exist. They can't be expelled because they mostly come from countries in war, but they are not asking for asylum here. The ethnographic work led in the camps in the north of France (since the pioneer work of Smain Laacher in Sangate [3]) questioned this transitory situation and its consequences. More recently, Sophie Djigo [4] shows the consequences of a double absence of desire : migrants want to leave, the inhabitants, the municipality and even the French government do not want them to stay either. The solutions imagined are thus imagined just for transit, with the minimum humanitarian support and trying to organize the invisibility of these "people undesired but stuck in the frontier". Camps, in this situation, appeared to be the only solution possible. The musical experiences on the camp, can not be understood without taking into account this reality, known and experienced in a different way by those who have been there.

3. Laacher, Smaïn, *Après Sangatte. Nouvelles immigrations. Nouveaux enjeux*, La Dispute, 2002.
4. Djigo, Sophie, *Les migrants de Calais, enquête sur la vie en transit.* Marseille : Agone, 2016.

2 Turning blind eyes in a grey area

Passage. The passage is the transit camp alpha and omega . If the exiles could pass without stopping, if they were not blocked by the border, the sea and the barbed wire, the camp would not exist. The border, in this form, generates a shadow economy whose kings are those who know how to disappear and make men, women and children disappear at the right time.

The smuggling activities are, as we said, part of the journey, part of the camp, and if the NGO's, the state or the municipality want to make the camp « work », they have to deal with this reality. Migrants didn't materialize themselves at the barrier of the camp magically, and their intention is rather clear : crossing illegally, to ask asylum legally in England. For that they need "smugglers", in order to pay for the crossing, they often also become for a few days or weeks "smugglers" themselves, which means recruiting exiles on the camp, helping with surveillance. So practically the distinction between "good migrants" who we need to help and support and bad "smugglers" is much more difficult than it seems to be. . .

It appears very soon in the field work that the ability of discriminating migrants between smugglers and non smugglers was important for many actors of the camp life. This discrimination seemed to be based on visual practices that enable to "recognize" the smugglers.

"Look : it's a smuggler", MSF employees slip me during my first visits to the camp and the city of Grande-Synthe.

Recognizing them, at a glance, is part of the knowledge from the field that is transmitted with covered words, by throwing a brief look, not too leaning, on the wrist that wears a watch a little too showy. "Smuggler" an implication when one evokes an exile who lingers more than a few weeks in the camp : those who do not cross are likely to help the others to cross . . . "Look" : an invitation to see the hints, to arrange them in a bundle that tightens around one another. An invitation to enter an open secret too. If humanitarian workers were "showing" me and "teaching" me how to see after a few days, even though this was not the purpose of my investigation, then everyone knew and . . . " closed his eyes" most of the time.

The first time I was a little puzzled : everybody seemed to know who was who, who did what. The police, the Information Services where present on the camp, but nearly nothing happened : the smugglers were not arrested, the camp wasn't closed. Finally, I realized that what was taught to me was not also to recognize a smuggler at first sight, but to close my eyes : that is to say to learn how to see without telling or testifying.

I long thought I could do exactly the same thing. The purpose of my study, the musical practices, was in a sort of way « protecting ». I had no reason to ask, nor to "see". Except that one day, one of my main informant, a camp musician, who was also a leader "became" a smuggler.

It became clear then that "smuggler" was a relational category : the way one could "recognize" a smuggler was based on the bundle of hints which result, as Carlo Ginz-

burg [5] showed, in a "probabilistic" logic. The "probability" opens a space of uncertainty which allows relational adjustment. The smuggler – as the duck of Wittgenstein- was there, but we could choose to see it or not...

B. H. who was considered as a good leader, nearly a hero, who was called to talk with the government authority by the mayor itself, whose help in running the camp was sollicitated by the NGO, became, during the first months of the summer 2016, "a smuggler". At the time, encampement's dynamic was strong. The new association in charge, the AFEJI, reinforced the control, materialized by barrier, by security guards etc... B. H. began to take a critical look at these new rules. He was demanding more auto-organisation, and autonomy for the exile, and he even threatened the mayor he could convince the exiles to quit the camp and to start a new Jungle.

Soon he began to be designated by NGO workers, by the camp "rumors" as a smuggler. The thing "everybody could see" : his power, his long stay on the camp, the material facilitaties he had, began to be talked about and pointed him as "smuggler". With some consequences : the volunteers were not so keen as they used to be to spend time with him, the part of the camp him and his family lived in became "dangerous".

Smuggling and dangerosity were, as Leonord Lecaine [6] showed in her work on prison, a way of reinforcing the alterity of the exiles, and a way of keeping a certain order in the camp even between the exiles themselves.

This little story shows how visual practices are complex and organized through a "know how to recognize" and a behavior judging publicly people "as". This was part of the camp order.

Considering the smuggling activities part in the camp order, and my own collaborations with B. H. as a musician, I decided to continue to turn a blind eye. Not in a naïve way, but as a resistance to the alterization game these visual practices of categorisations were part of.

These forms of categorisation were desingularization's forms [7] : they reduced B. H. to the characteristics of the category constructed in the camp situation of "smuggler" and reduced his agency. I decided to continue to look at him as B. H., a musician in exile, who had things to say and from whom I could learn.

Of course, it was not as simple as that : I had to regulate my own distance- resist to some propositions or demand to help sometimes. And it is difficult to resist to the situation moral order and more than once I felt like asking more precise questions about the crossing activities in order just to know. But I had to resist this desire of knowing in order to keep my relations peaceful and possible.

5. Ginzburg, Carlo. « Signes, traces, pistes. Racines d'un paradigme de l'indice », *Le Débat*, vol. 6, no. 6, 1980, p. 3-44.

6. Le Caisne, Léonord, De si dangereux condamnés, construction sociale de la dangerosité en prison. *Journal des anthropologues,* 2007, p. *108-109.*

7. Boltanski, Luc, *L'Amour et la Justice comme compétences : trois essais de sociologie de l'action.* Paris, Métailié, 1990.

3 The surveillance system

With the crossing's economy comes the surveillance. The camp was a space of multiple surveillance : from the "smugglers", the camp managers , the police and intelligence service. Choosing the relevant glance and observation posture was then, a problem. No one was indifferent to the observational activities because everybody knew it could have consequences on the smuggling activities' security.

In these circumstances, adjusting my position was not only an ethical but very practical problem.

Annalisa Lendaro [8], in an article on her field work in Lampedusa expresses the same concern, doubled in her case by the necessity made by her initial research, a documentary project, to take images and to have a camera. She was systematically taken for a journalist in a context of over-mediatization. The confidence needed was then very difficult to gain.

In the Grande-Synthe camp, and in Calais and other camps, both informal or formal, the issues of photography has rapidly been taken into account by exiles, or volunteers. A month after the opening of the La Linière camp, photography was banned from the camp. A pictogram signaled it at the entrance, and if one began to take pictures with a camera, the exiles present would protest immediately.

These concerns about the research posture and the good "gaze" to address exiles, merge with the questions I had to deal with as a cultural worker : what could we organize in such a situation, with people in transit ? We were rapidly aware that the places/ roles in the camp were very static, and that one of the characteristic of camp life was the absence of possibilities to act and make choices for your own life. This dimension of the camp life and the impossibility to have control on your own life is well documented in the studies on migrants camp and humanitarian work. The division between the volunteers and humanitarian workers who gave and the exile who received was very strict. It was obvious that the volunteers were always in action, and that the exiles had to wait. They wait in lines for the various goods and services the camp could provide, but also wait for the smugglers to come and provoke the opportunities to cross.

Therefore, we decided not to organize concerts in the camp the exiles could only attend, but we tried to open the possibilities for them to organize it themselves. We built a small stage, brought a sound system, microphones for Newruz, and we began to work with the musicians present in order to allow them to play, first in the camp and then even outside.

These activities allowed me to have long conversations (in English) with B. H. and to build links by and with music with him, his family and some other musicians. It gave me also a legitimacy of being in the camp, not observing, but building with exiles, and trying to put words on their experiences through recording sessions and radio program. This position was contested sometimes by other humanitarian organizations

8. Lendaro, Annalisa. « Lampedusa, « terrain difficile » ? Enquêter sur la légalité à la frontière de l'Europe », *Migrations Société*, vol. 167, no. 1, 2017, p. 29-40.

who tried more than once to transform me in a volunteer. Each time, the exiles contested these attempts, fetching me in the middle of a task I had accepted to be nice to the volunteers. B. H. once even told me "you are not here to do that" (helping building a tent).

The way I decided to deal with the surveillance system and with the camp order was led by the perspective of not looking at the exiles musical activities, but looking at what we were doing together. This displacement, helped me to construct a perspective slightly different and to take into account my one position in the camp situation. A way of making an echo to what Tim Ingold advocated for : for an anthropology *'free to bring ways of knowing and feeling shaped through transformational engagements with people from around the world, both within and beyond the settings of fieldwork, to the essentially prospective task of helping to find a way into a future common to all of us"*[9].

4 Listening to the camp/ stop looking at/ starting paying attention to

Turning blind eyes can also be an invitation to let other senses than the eyes to guide me in the understanding of the situation. The sensible order of the camp is not only visible, it is also perceivable in the soundscapes of the camp.

In these soundscapes, music played a major role, musicalisation of the places through the use of smartphones, or little sound systems shaped the camp and organized "threshold effect" protecting a group from being heard, marking a form of appropriation of a collective equipment. The actualization of a meeting between exiles of different musical backgrounds or more often, between exiles and volunteers of the camp through shared songs.

The camp's soundscape tell us a lot of what Jacques Rancière[10] calls a political aesthetic, distributing the perceptible and though the parts we take to the collective life and the possibilities of recognition.

In the musical and audible camp regime, women voices, and women listening activities were completely silent. No women on stages ; no women in the public of the concerts, no women in the collective music listening places.

Women represent 10% of the camp exiles. Considering this and once I had understood how the capacity of playing music was linked to the way musicians could gain power on the camp. I decided to make a focus on these feminine practices and to diminish a little my support to the male musicians.

The women's and children's center opening, enabled women to break out of the shelters relative isolation and opened a place for women. This closed place, without window, sheltered feminine sociabilities, and substracted them a little to the surveillance system.

9. Ingolg, Tim (2013) *Making Anthropolgy, Archeology, Art and Architecture.* London : Routledge, p. 6.
10. Rancière, Jacques, *Le partage du sensible*, La Fabrique, Paris, 2000.

To find my place there, I simply came in once or twice a week, from the end of August to the end of November 2016. I spent two or three hours at the Women Center, with my mobile phone, connected to a mobile speaker. I brought a snack and I invited the women present to browse YouTube or Deezer and "play the DJ", either from my own phone or from theirs, connecting to the speaker. This simple presence allowed me to put into practice a kind of care ethics, guided by questions : "how to do, in such a situation, to preserve and maintain the human relations that are at stake ? And, how can it be done without reinforcing the inequalities of gender, class and race ?" It was not just a matter of looking at the women in the camp musical practices and experiences, but finding a way to investigate and return the work that guarantees respect for their singularity and capabilities. This work ethic had to take into account the actual conditions of life on the camp in other words, the situation. And would require, as Gilligan pointed out, *"a more contextual and narrative way of thinking than formal and abstract"*[11]. Finally, it corresponded to an attempt to open my eyes to see better as emphasized by Donna Haraway, that is to say to take back the power of vision in concrete, engaged, connected, involved projects [12].

What did I discover ? Nothing very new in fact : that listening collectively to music, in a situation of caring, can be described as a sort of game, a double performance : a musical performance, and a performance of oneself. Following Tia DeNora's proposals [13], music in this situation could be considered as a kind of "asylum". That is to say a place and a time place in which one feels safe, a place open to creativity, a place of recognition of its existence as someone. In this perspective, asylum is not the total institution of Goffman, but a place of "rehabilitation" which, for DeNora, functions *via* the possibility of engaging in common activities, including, for example, listening to music together. The musical asylum opens up the possibility of self-realization, through negotiation and adaptation with others. Tia DeNora distinguishes two asylum's forms, those that operate on the principle of retirement, and those that operate on the principle of the rearrangement of a world of relationships and possibilities, what she calls "refurnishing" : to give back skills and to act on the design of space to open catches to action. These two asylum's forms can be combined : the "rehabilitating" asylum is also a place of withdrawal from the "ordinary" social world. It has also to do with the construction of shared value : to choose a music piece for a collective listening is to share something that is valued, that is good in the present situation, it is also to engage in the common lived moment.

When we collectively managed to musicalise the Women Center so that the majority of women would engage in the session and we could influence the place's atmosphere, we demonstrated an ability to act on our environment, an ability that few situations on the camp, and in the course of exile in general, is allowed.

11. Quoted by Sandra Laugier in : Laugier, Sandra. « L'éthique du care en trois subversions », Multitudes, vol. 42, no. 3, 2010, p. 112-125.

12. Haraway, Donna, 2007 « Savoirs situés : la question de la sciences dans le féminisme et le privilège de la perspective partielle » in Laurence Allard, Delphine Gardey, Nathalie Magnan (eds), *Manifeste Cyborg et autres essais- Sciences-Fictions-Féminismes*, Paris, Exils, p. 107-142.

13. De Nora, Tia, *Music Asylum, Wellbing through music in Everyday Life*, New York, Routledge, 2016.

5 Considering You Tube

The mobile phone and its connection to the Internet and streaming platforms have played a vital role in making music a medium for articulating the multiple dimensions of the world lived by exiles, particularly because it allowed alternating musical choices from the personal libraries contained on the phones (mine and those of some of the women) with choices from the musical offer formatted *via* YouTube mainly. The availability of titles searched on YouTube validated the existence of a community of taste beyond the camp. Fans of the singers we wanted to listen to, the singers themselves, had taken the trouble to post these contents on the platform, to put them in shape, to comment on them, to make covers, to add images and translations etc ... The women of Grande-Synthe mobilized and relied on the creative activity of YouTube users to invent ways to be women, Kurds, exiled in this place of the Women Center. The combination of these resources available online and through phones allowed them to connect their worlds and experience to their actual reality. That of their life in their home country, their diasporic belonging, and their life here on the camp. Most singers are members of the large Kurdish diaspora and have themselves experienced camps in Iraq or Iran. This omnipresence of exile in the women's media landscapes in the camp helped to situate their adventure in an aesthetic and cultural history. The pieces we listened to were often Kurdish clips variety show from various Kurdish television channels or Kurdish transnational channels available on YouTube. The kurdish media history is linked to the struggles for the independence of Kurdistan, and to the ideological and political ones that animate the different Kurdish regions and autonomous movements. During the sessions, the women present alternated excerpts of NRT2 and extracts of Kurdistan TV broadcasts with very different positioning and history. This does not mean that the program extracts recontextualization in the organized stream from YouTube indexing criteria completely eliminates the program and the sender, or even completely breaks the ideological charge carried by the channel. The very programs style , up to the sound quality , the stage colors, the presenters clothes and the public often shown, remain elements organized from the channel perspective ; but, listened-watched as part of our meetings, with as a first request the name of the interpreter, the fact that we can identify these videos first as variety shows extracts, with their codes, shows the way these elements were only potential holds held remotely *via* the reassembly for the musical experience. Finally, this ideological framework of the Kurdish media is part of exiles and Kurds life in general. The way women used YouTube and its possibilities of rearrangement indicates how they "do with" and "in" this particular media context for, in fine, listen to music. This does not mean that the source broadcasts politico-ideological load is destroyed by the interpretation, nor, conversely, that the ideology continues to work masked, without the knowledge of these women. It is here all the sensible richness, all the (inter) subjective potential power of music : to open interpretative possibilities whose seizure remains partly unpredictable and, in any case, irreducible. The musical landscapes were constituted through a available musical resources' "relocation" and this activity has consequences that must be assumed : comforting one of the participants who starts to cry listening to one of the selected music for example. These gestures of comfort were part of the "rehabilitation" work that the musical experience opened up. Considering the actual

musical practices of these Women, I had to analyse music as an audio-visual production. The Kurdish landscapes of the video-clips, the visual aesthetic of a TV show, the way some of the women present absorbed themselves in the watching of the video clips were parts of the situation.

Finally, the choices could be also the occasion of disagreements manifestation. Often, these disagreements were more alive between the children present or between the children and the adults. The negotiations, and sometimes the impossibility of reaching an agreement other than that of the distribution of time between the different protagonists (we listen to your song and then we will listen to yours), opened at least the possibility of thinking about the hospitality of this "Musical asylum" not only as a hospitality based on the ability to recognize and produce points of agreement, but also as a hospitality of cohabitation, sometimes even a hospitality of "confrontation", that is to say a hospitality rendered possible by ability to confront without excluded.

6 Paying attention to vulnerability/ Giving room to engagement and disengagement

Moreover, engaging in the proposed musical experience is to agree to play and it required a form of availability sometimes impossible in the encampment conditions . The fact that the music is "available for the ears of others" and the lightness of the device, however, allowed to create "minimal openings" ie forms of recognition of the presence without obligation of a commitment that would go up to to prevent the withdrawal. In my opinion it is precisely in this variety of disengagement forms authorized by the fragility of certain "catches" that the hospitality of the Women Center during the listening sessions was best guaranteed. If the care ethics involves paying attention to vulnerability, if it requires a particular gaze, it might be said, it also implies attention to commitment provisions. A care ethics could imply a right to disengagement. The shared listening sessions stopped during the month of November, when we had to realize that the Women Center could no longer offer the necessary conditions for this musical asylum production that we were trying to build and to which we had sometimes given shape. The place degradation, open to drafts, the growing difficulty of maintaining the place unmixed character, the exacerbated tensions between exiles and the difficulty of maintaining a dialogue with the volunteers who tried to make it live every day, themselves under heavy pressure, put and end the experiment. Shortly after, in January 2017, the Women Center was the target of a fire. Rebuilt, it was again destroyed in the camp fire. Today, an English association has organized a mobile Women Center, an equipped truck adapted to the life conditions on precarious camps.

7 Making shelters

Music, taken in its spatial and material context, in the interactions, the stories and the events which punctuate the camp life, participated, as suggests by Nicolas Puig to modulate the forms of proximity and remoteness. In his work on Palestinian musicians in the camps in Lebanon, Nicolas Puig considers the role of musical practices in the

strengthening of the spaces of intimacy, the possibility of self-preservation and building relations to other social worlds, possibly, but not necessarily, more legitimate.

For him, musical practices, playing as well as listening, contributes to the establishment of a home, a place "for oneself", Nicolas Puig [14]. We would say "musical asylums". He shows how music, for those who value it, participates to produce the domestic and emotional relationship to places of living. It contributes to build "another camp memory, built in its attendance by its inhabitants and can be define in terms of place of living"[15]. However, the Palestinian camps in Lebanon have a much greater social and historical depth than the precarious Grande-Synthe and Calais camps, which were essentially transit camps. Yet, even in transit situations in which the appropriation of standardized forms of precarious housing – the container, the "shelter" – is limited, ambivalent forms of attachment, supported by activities of appropriation of spaces and domestic places exist. The musical moments, sometimes filmed and shared on the social networks, including after the passage in England, by the exiles, participate to build a memory of the camp as place of living. In Grande-Synthe, by redesigning the camp space and the time, by creating "threshold effects", the musical practices participated to enhance the sociabilities and gave density to the camp cold spaces.

From the solitary listening of one's phone, sometimes in public, to the concert- the camp has thus sheltered a set of musical situations with different potentials articulating subjectivation and commitment. It is also obvious that music has helped to assert authority figures, as in the case of B. H. The musical practices were taken in the dynamics of power, and contributed to it, especially in a space saturated by surveillance of all towards all, regulated by the issue of the crossing of the border. On the camp, having one's music heard was the mark of a power to act, including for exiles too often considered in militant speeches, as well as in many academic works, as a homogeneous collective of victims whereas the differences in status are extremely important.

The analysis of musical practices, taken in their material, spatial, relational, political and historical contexts, reveals the impossibility of deploying a grid of binary or dialectical analysis that would reduce music to the exact reflection of power relations, or to a simple expression of'a culture, or a strategic' tool' and, on the other hand, music as an instrument of individuation and resistance. On the contrary, the analysis of practices allows us rather to consider the entanglement of multiple realities [16] that constitute the fabric of musical experiences. Its multiple realities are actualized in the experience. The musical situation potentialities that may or may not be grasped, are understood or considered.

In these conditions, we can probably understand the complexity and fragility of the spaces that allow us to engage in shared musical experiences, but we can also make room for subalternized musical experiences, and thus pluralize the understanding of musical experiences. To do so, we must be able to look at the forms of mediation of

14. Puig Nicolas, « Entre villes et camps : musiciens palestiniens au Liban », *Autrepart* 1/2008 (n° 45), p. 29.

15. Idem, p. 21

16. De Nora, Tia, *Making sense of reality, culture and perception in Everyday life*, London, SAGE, 2014

specific collectives in order to understand asymmetries of capacity and differentials of "vulnerability"[17]. In such way, plurality can appear in contemporary musical experiences, without being reduced to the plurality of the identities of those who live them. From this perspective, we can follow forms of asylum and hospitality that underlie and make possible our shared existence. It is also a way to take seriously into account Donna Haraway's statement, who considers the situation both ecological, political and cultural from the perspective of the destruction of the shelters from where lives can heal, regain forces, and who urges us to find ways of building such spaces.

References and readings

Abdulkarim, Amir (1998) « Les kurdes irakiens en Europe, Nouveaux boat people », Revue européenne des migrations internationales, vol. 14, No. 1, p. 263-276.

Agier, Michel ; Lecadet, Clara (dir.) (2014) Un monde de camps, Paris, La Découverte.

Akpinar, Zozan (2007) « L'État turc face aux télévisions transfrontières kurdes », in Mattelart, T. (dir) Médias, migrations et cultures transnationales, Bruxelles, De Boeck Supérieur, p. 89-102.

Anthony Pecqueux ; Roueff, Olivier (dir.) (2009) Ecologie sociale de l'oreille, Paris, EHESS.

Appaduraï, Arjun, Après le colonialisme, les conséquences culturelles de la mondialisation, Paris, Payot, 2015.

Boe, Carolina ; Fisher, Nicolas (2010) "L'ethnographe en milieu fermé. Deux enquêtes sur les étrangers en prison et en rétention administrative face à l'expertise associative et aux enjeux de la publication", in : Laurens, Sylvain ; Neyrat, Frédéric (dir.), Enquêter : de quel droit ? Menaces sur l'enquête en sciences sociales, Bellecombe-en-Bauges : Éditions du Croquant, p. 117-138.

Boltanski, Luc, *L'Amour et la Justice comme compétences : trois essais de sociologie de l'action*, Paris, Métailié, 1990.

Bouillon, Florence ; Fresia, Marion ; Tallio, Virginie (dir.) (2006), Terrains sensibles. Expériences actuelles de l'anthropologie, Paris : Éditions de l'EHESS.

Breviglieri, Marc ; Stavo-Debauge, Joan (2006) « Sous les conventions. Accompagnement social à l'insertion : entre sollicitude et sollicitation », in François Eymard-Duvernay (dir.), L'économie des conventions. Méthodes et résultats. Tome II. Développements, Paris, Découverte.

Da Lage, Émilie ; Debruyne, François (2015) « Les refrains de la mondialisation. Variations critiques, dissonances et consonances de l'économie politique de la communication et des cultural studies », Réseaux, vol. 192, No. 4, p. 115-142.

Da Lage, Emilie (2016) « La musique, le temps, le camp », Lequette, Samuel, Levergos, Delphine (dir.) Décamper ! Paris, La découverte, 2016, pp143, 147.

De Nora, Tia, Making sense of reality, culture and perception in Everyday life, London, SAGE, 2014.

— Music Asylum, Wellbing through music in Everyday Life, New York, Routledge, 2016.

Debruyne, François (2015) « Faire et de (dé)faire d'une expérience publique de l'écoute », *Culture et Musées*, No. 25, Arles, Actes Sud, p. 69-93.

Djigo, Sophie, *Les migrants de Calais, enquête sur la vie en transit.* Marseille : Agone, 2016.

Gayet-Viaud, Carole (2010) La critique du concept de culture, Ethnographies féministes et subalternes, in Cefaï, D. (dir.), L'Engagement ethnographique, Paris, EHESS éditions, p. 399-415.

Haraway, Donna (2007) « Savoirs situés : la question de la science dans le féminisme et le privilège de la perspective partielle » in Laurence Allard ; Delphine Gardey ; Nathalie Magnan (eds), Manifeste Cyborg et autres essais- Sciences-Fictions-Féminismes, Paris, Exils, p. 107-142.

(2016) « Anthropocène, Capitalocène, Plantationocène, Chthulucène. Faire des parents », *Multitudes*, vol. 65, no. 4, p. 75-81.

17. Breviglieri, Marc, et Stavo-Debauge, Joan « Sous les conventions. Accompagnement social à l'insertion : entre sollicitude et sollicitation », in François Eymard-Duvernay (dir.), *L'économie des conventions. Méthodes et résultats. Tome II. Développements*, Paris, Découverte, 2006.

Hennion, Antoine (2001) « Music lovers taste as performance », Theory culture and society, No. 18.

Ingolg, Tim, *Making Anthropolgy, Archeology, Art and Architecture.* London : Routledge, 2013.

Isaac Joseph (1007) « Prises, Réserves, Epreuves », Communications, vol. 65, No. 1, p. 131-142.

Laacher Smaïn, *Après Sangatte. Nouvelles immigrations. Nouveaux enjeux*, La Dispute, 2002.

Laugier, Sandra (2010) « L'éthique du care en trois subversions », Multitudes, vol. 42, no. 3, p. 112-125.

Le Caisne, Léonor (2007) « De si dangereux condamnés, construction sociale de la dangerosité en prison ». *Journal des anthropologues, 108-109*, p. 183-210.

Lendaro, Annalisa (2017) « Lampedusa, « terrain difficile » ? Enquêter sur la légalité à la frontière de l'Europe », *Migrations Société*, vol. 167, no. 1, p. 29-40.

Makaremi, Chowra (2009) Zone d'attente pour personne en instance. Une ethnographie de la détention frontalière en France, Thèse en anthropologie, Montréal : Université de Montréal.

Makaremi, Chowra (2008) « Participer en observant. Étudier et assister les étrangers aux frontières », in : Fassin, Didier ; Bensa, Alban (dir.), Les politiques de l'enquête. Épreuves ethnographiques, Paris : Éd. La Découverte, p. 165-183.

Mbembe, Achille, Politiques de l'inimitié, La découverte, Paris, 2016.

Pecqueux, Antony (2012) « Politiques des ambiances – Que faire du fond inextricablement politique des ambiances ? » Thibaud, Jean-Paul and Siret, Daniel. Ambiances in action / Ambiances en acte(s) – International Congress on Ambiances, Montreal, Canada. International Ambiances Network, p. 145-150, 2012. <halshs-00745877>

Puig, Nicolas (2008) « Entre villes et camps : musiciens palestiniens au Liban », Autrepart vol. 1, No. 45, p. 59-72.

Rancière, Jacques, Le partage du sensible, La Fabrique, Paris, 2000.

Roussel, Cyril (2013) « Circulations à la frontière entre Kurdes d'Irak et Kurdes d'Iran. », *EchoGéo* [En ligne], 25. https://journals-openedition-org.ressources-electroniques.univ-lille.fr/echogeo/13550